Committee on Finance. I wrote two letters. A week ago also, again I wrote to the Prime Minister. The Prime Minister himself, when he was the Leader of Opposition, had opposed this scheme.

प्रो॰ राम देव भंडारी: सर, राष्ट्रीय जनता दल ने..

श्री सभापति: आप क्या बोल रहे हैं, रिकॉर्ड पर नहीं जाएगा। आप बैठ जाइए।

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: Sir, it is against the principles. ....*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, it has gone on record. ....*(Interruptions)*... It has gone on record, rest assured ....*(Interruptions)*... Please take your seat. Please take you seats. Please take your seats. ....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. HANUMANTHA RAO (Andhra Pradesh): They are getting fifty lakhs of rupees. ....*(Interruptions)*... Whatever funds the MPs are getting ....*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seats ....*(Interruptions)*... ठीक है, ठीक है, ठीक है, आपने कह दिया। सदन की भावनाएं माननीय सदस्यों को पता लग गई। जीरो ऑवर।

MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION

Concealment of fact in on answer given to Unstarred Question pertaining to the transfer of assets of the Nagpur Airport to the State Govt. of Maharashtra

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी (पश्चिमी बंगाल): सर, मैं संसद के एक और मर्यादा वाले प्रश्न पर आपके सामने खड़ा हूं। On the 6th of December, Sir, myself and Mr. Chittabrata Majumdar had put a question to the Minister of Civil Aviation asking whether the Minister is considering transfer of assets of Nagpur Airport to the state Government of Maharashtra at a notional cost in lieu of waiver of stamp duty and other taxes applicable to modernisation of Mumbai Airport. I am sorry to say, Sir, that the answer did not say either 'yes' or 'no'. I had again put the same thing before you, Sir, for reconsideration. Meanwhile, I have given a document to you authenticating that, which shows though these

questions were replied on 6th December, on the 11th of August, a document specifically says that 'the Government of Maharashtra has agreed to the request of the Ministry of Civil Aviation for waiver of stamp duty on the transfer of assets to the Mumbai Airport. In lieu of this, the Ministry of Civil Aviation has also agreed to transfer the assets of Nagpur Airport to the Government of Maharashtra at a nominal cost of rupee one!" So, the second part of my question is... ...(*Interruptions*)... I am not coming to the 'shame' part of it, Sir. I am only on the quesiton of transparency as the Minister has just now said. My second part of the quesiton was: "The details thereof, outlining the value of assets of Nagpur Airport and estimated amount of tax exemption, offered by the state Government." That question was not replied at all. I am afraid, Sir, this is the trend where the Parliament is being taken for a ride. The Document is before you, Sir.

श्री सभापति: ठीक है।

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: Now, my demand, as I told you, Sir, is, either the Minsiter should come with a corrected version of the reply or for पार्लियमामेंट्री मर्यादा, आप जानते हैं, जो कार्यवाही है, it is for the Parliament to decide—even if it is an Unstarred Question, I am sure, the Minister has not overlooked it—for an Unstarred Question also, when a specific question is there, and when such a serious issue involving public money is raised I am not going into the details of the case; this whole thing is to help certain parties at the cost of AAI or whatever it is. I want a detailed reply, either a correct reply, or whether he denies any such existence or whether it is a thing which will be decided afterwards.

श्री सभापति: मंत्री जी, आप कुछ कहना चाहते हैं।

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU (West Bengal): Sir, before he says something, this whole issue is against the backing of irregularities at different stages and, therefore, Sir, we want that an inquiry should be instituted and the accountability should be fixed. I mean, the House cannot be taken for a ride like this. It is clear that the House has been misled. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The matter is on record. Will you please respond to it, Mr. Minister?

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF CIVIL AVIATION

(SHRI PRAFUL PATEL): Sir, I note the concern of the hon. Members. I can only say at this stage that whatever information was given in our written reply to the House was and is the stated position. Whatever document has been given to you, Sir, by him or whatever document he has placed on the Table for authentication, I have not seen that, but I am going by media reports that there was some letter by the Maharashtra Government stating that the Nagpur Airport would be transferred in lieu of the waiver of stamp duty, I think no decision of the Government of India. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: It is concerning the decision. ...(*Interruptions*)... Whether it is under consideration or not, that is my specific question. ...(*Interruptions*)... My question is whether it is under consideration or not. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him finish ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: One second. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him finish. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: Listen to me. Shall I just give you a little background if you want to know?

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: I said, "I want an answer in 'yes' or 'no' ...(*Interruptions*)... my question is very specific. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Mukherjee, let him finish. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: I need not have responded to it now. ...(*Interruptions*)... I need not have responded, but I am telling this to you, since I am here, and since you have raised the question. There is no question of misleading the House, Sir. This is number one, Sir.Regarding the issue of stamp duty, let us be very clear, ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIPANKAR; MUKHERJEE: I am not on that issue. I want to know whether it is under consideration or not.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him speak. ...(*Interruptions*)... let him speak. ...(*Interruptions*)... You have brought the matter to the notice of the House and of the Government, both. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please take your seat. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: That means it is under consideration.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. Shri B.J. Panda. ...(*Interruptions*)... Shri B.J. Panda. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: I have not asked for the decision.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. B.J. Panda. ...(*Interruptions*)... That matter is over. ...(*Interruptions*)... Shri B.J. Panda. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: Sir, I am on a question of protection. ...(*Interruptions*)... How can the Minister say that it is under consideration? ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: I have not said it. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: What is the value of the assets? ...(*Interruptions*)... What is the value of the assets of the Nagpur airport? ...(*Interruptions*)... What is the value of the assets? ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री सभापतिः माननीय सदस्य, आपको ...(व्यवधान)... Please take your seats. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please take your seats. (Interruptions)...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसुः आपको हमें संरक्षण देना ही होगा।

श्री सभापतिः नहीं, संरक्षण देना हो तब भी ...(व्यवधान)

श्री नीलोत्पल बसुः यह बहुत ही साफ सवाल है कि क्या गवर्नमेंट इसे अपने संज्ञान में लेकर कंसिडर कर रही है या नहीं।

श्री सभापतिः माननीय सदस्य, एक मिनट सुनिए ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसुः सवाल पूछा जाता है जानकारी लेने के लिए, लेकिन, सर, मुझे नहीं मालूम है कि क्वेश्चन कब से जानकारी न देने का इंस्ट्रूमेंट बन गया है। ...(व्यवधान)

श्री सभापतिः नहीं, आप जो कह रहे हैं, वह सही है ...(व्यवधान)

श्री नीलोत्पल बसुः नहीं आपको आपकी राय बतानी पड़ेगी। ...(व्यवधान) Sir, the Government is considering. ...(*Interruptions*)... Can't he say yes or no? ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seats. ...(*Interruptions*)... एक मिनट आप बैठ जाइए, मेरी बात तो सुनिए ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु: सवाल का जवाब होता है जानकारी प्राप्त करने के लिए। जानकारी न देने के लिए अगर सरकार जवाब देने के अधिकार को इस्तेमाल करती है तब उससे अफसोसनाक बात कुछ और नहीं हो सकती है और तब इस संसद की मर्यादा, जिसकी हिफाज़त के लिए आपने पहले बयान दिया है, उसका कोई मतलब नहीं बनता। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: आप बैठ जाइए। यह क्वेश्चन तो है नहीं, यह तो रेफरेंस है। चूंकि मंत्री महोदय यहां पर थे, तो उन्होंने जवाब दे दिया, अगर आपको कोई और जवाब चाहिए ...(व्यवधान)... पहले मेरी बात सुन लीजिए, जो भी जवाब उन्होंने दिया है, उससे if you are not satisfied, you are allowed to raise it again, when there is a chance.

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी: मेरे क्वेश्चन को आप देख लीजिए, नहीं तो क्वेश्चन करने का कोई फायदा नहीं है। No, Sir. There is no question.... ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No. Now, I would not allow you. ...(*Interruptions*)... Now, I would not allow you. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: A corrected answer must come. ...(*Interruptions*)..,

MR. CHAIRMAN: Excuse me, Mr. Mukherjee. ...(*Interruptions*)... Now, I would not allow you. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री रद्दनारायण पाणि (उड़ीसा): यह बोलने का आपका क्या अधिकार बनता है।

श्री सभापति: आप बैठिए, बैठिए। मैं उसे देख लूंगा।

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: Then we should not have asked the question. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री सभापति: मैं उसे देख लूंगा।

Uncertainity prevailing over setting up of a National Institute of Science in Bubhaneswar

SHRI B.J. PANDA (Orissa): Sir, with your permission, I raise a matter which is agitating the people of Orissa and it is a grave matter.